Nature Biotechnology

Peer-reviewed surveys indicate positive impact of commercialized GM crops

Janet Carpenter

Nature Biotechnology (2010), 28 (4), 319-321

Peer-reviewed surveys indicate positive impact of commercialized GM crops

Summary

A large-scale analysis of farmers experience with GM crops concludes that

Farmers all over the world have benefitted from GM crops.

Farmers report:

- greater yields
- improved economic performance
- Smallest farmers benefit most
- GM crops benefit the environment through:
- Decrease in tillage operations
- Decrease in insecticide applications



Methodology

- > 49 peer-reviewed studies reporting on farmer surveys
- Farmers from 12 countries both in the developing and the developed world
- The farmer surveys made a comparison on yields and other indicators of economic performance of GM and non-GM crops.
- The main GM traits evaluated are insect resistance and herbicide tolerance.

First time that at this scale farmers experience with GM crops is brought together and compared.



GM Crop cultivating countries in 2009

- In 2009, 14 million farmers in 25 countries grew GM crops commercially
- 90% of them were small farmers in developing countries



Source: ISAAA Brief 41-2009: Global Status of Commercialized Biotech/GM Crops: 2009-The First Fourteen Years, 1996-2009 (2010)

Comparison of GMOs to non-GMOs

Yield

• 74% of results comparing yields of biotech and conventional crops showed positive results for adopters of biotech technology versus non-adopters

• Farmers in developing countries are achieving greater yield increases (16-30%) than farmers in developed countries (up to 7%)

• The largest yield increases are reported by Indian Bt cotton farmers (up to 150%).



Positive No Difference Negative

Source: Peer-reviewed surveys indicate positive impact of commercialized GM crops (2010) Nature Biotechnology, 28 (4), 319-321

Comparison of GMOs to non-GMOs Yield, by country

Country	Positive	Neutral	Negative	Total
Developed countries	36	18	7	61
Australia	0	2	2	4
Canada	7	0	1	8
Spain	3	6	0	9
United States	26	10	4	40
Developing countries	88	13	6	107
Argentina	5	1	0	6
China	15	0	0	15
Colombia	4	1	0	5
India	35	2	6	43
Mexico	2	0	0	2
Philippines	5	2	0	7
Romania	2	0	0	2
South Africa	20	7	0	27
Total	124	32	13	168

Significant yield increases are achieved with GM crops, especially in developing countries

Comparison of GMOs to non-GMOs Yield, by technology

Technology	Difference in yield (%)	Number of results	Minimum (%)	Maximum (%)	Standard error of mean (%)
Developed countries	6	59	-12	26	1.0
Herbicide-tolerant cotton	0	6	-12	17	3.8
Herbicide-tolerant soybean	7	14	0	20	1.7
Herbicide-tolerant and insect-resistant cotton	З	2	-3	9	5.8
Insect-resistant corn	4	13	-3	13	1.6
Insect-resistant cotton	7	24	-8	26	1.9
Developing countries	29	107	-25	150	2.9
Herbicide-tolerant corn	85	1			
Herbicide-tolerant soybean	21	3	0	35	11
Insect-resistant corn	16	12	0	38	4
Insect-resistant corn (white)	22	9	0	62	6.9
Insect-resistant cotton	30	82	-25	150	3.5

Greater yield increases are achieved in developing countries, especially for herbicidetolerant corn and insect-resistant cotton.

Comparison of GMOs to non-GMOs Economic performance

72% of the results indicate a positive impact for biotech crops on economic performance



Comparison of GMOs to non-GMOs Economic performance, by technology

• Seed cost goes up, but this is offset by increase in yield and decrease in pesticide use.

- For herbicide-tolerant crops, 71% show a positive impact on economic performance
- For insect-resistant crop, 74% show a positive impact on economic performance



Source: Peer-reviewed surveys indicate positive impact of commercialized GM crops (2010) Nature Biotechnology, 28 (4), 319-321

Influence of GMOs on the environment

Biotech crops help preserve the environment by facilitating conservation tillage and reducing the number of applications of insecticides.

• For herbicide-tolerant crops, two surveys (for soybeans in Argentina and the U.S.) report decreases of 25-58% in the number of tillage operations.

• For insect-resistant crops, the number of insecticide applications used on Bt crops compared to conventional crops was reduced by a range of 14% to 76%.

