

Subject: PLoS ONE Decision [09-PONE-RA-14368]

From: PLoSONE@plos.org

Date: Mon, 21 Dec 2009 16:01:13 UT

To: harri.hemila@helsinki.fi

Dear Dr. Hemila,

Thank you very much for submitting your manuscript "Zinc lozenges may shorten the duration of colds: a systematic review" for review by PLoS ONE. After careful consideration, we have decided that your manuscript does not meet one or several of our criteria and must be rejected for publication.

Specifically:

1. the outcome, i.e "common cold" is never defined, nor discussed, though a very subjective one.
2. statistical analysis of this meta-analysis of randomised trial is not standard (standard methods include: use of random-effect models, estimation of I^2 statistic, funnel plot to search evidence of publication bias). Moreover, given the scientific question of interest and the subjective nature of the outcome, a meta-analysis on individual data would be preferable.

Unfortunately, due to the concerns described above, we cannot accept a revised version of your manuscript. I am sorry that we cannot be more positive on this occasion, but hope that you appreciate the reasons for this decision.

Sincerely,

Dr Geneviève Chêne
Academic Editor, PLoS ONE
